November 2023



ESFRI LANDMARK MONITORING GUIDE 3RD BATCH

PUBLIC

November 2023



TABLE OF CONTENTS

BACKGROUND	3
KEY FEATURES OF THE LANDMARK MONITORING PROCESS	3
ROLE OF THE MONITORING COMMITTEE	4
MONITORING PANELS	4
PRINCIPLES, CONFLICT OF INTEREST (COI) AND CONFIDENTIALITY	5
IMPLEMENTATION OF THE MONITORING PROCESS	6
TIMELINE	6
ATTRIBUTION OF LANDMARKS TO MONITORING BATCHES	7



BACKGROUND

ESFRI Landmarks were introduced in the ESFRI Roadmap 2016 as reference RIs and are pillars in the ERA landscape offering not only services to academic research, but also supporting development and innovation. Guaranteeing the excellence of the Landmark label, ESFRI has responsibility for monitoring the quality of the RIs listed in the ESFRI roadmap as Landmarks.

In the follow-up to the Competitiveness Council Conclusions of May 2018¹, and the pilot review of four Landmarks assessing the scientific status and their implementation, ESFRI has set up an *ad hoc* Working Group on "*Monitoring of Research Infrastructures Performance*"². It prepared a final report containing general criteria for Landmark and RI assessment and considerations for implementing an appropriate methodology in the future. This report addressed various aspects of Landmarks and developed a set of KPIs. The report was approved and published by ESFRI in December 2019³.

The *ad hoc* Working Group also recommended a quality standard for Key Performance Indicators (the "RACER-Criteria")⁴ and a dialogue process between the RIs and the evaluating organisations to define the most appropriate KPIs that would at the same time fulfil the objectives of the ESFRI assessment.

In order to prepare and implement a fully consistent procedure for monitoring of ESFRI Landmarks, ESFRI has set up another working group, namely the "Monitoring Implementation Group", with the mandate to propose a methodology for the monitoring of Landmarks on the ESFRI Roadmap. The working group has prepared a report, which identified options for implementation of Landmark monitoring by ESFRI and provided directions for further development of the ESFRI monitoring framework and for uptake of the ESFRI monitoring approach beyond the Landmarks⁵.

KEY FEATURES OF THE LANDMARK MONITORING PROCESS

Landmark monitoring by ESFRI has the following objectives:

- enabling regular exchange between ESFRI and Landmarks on their long-term development;
- assessing the quality of each individual Landmark;
- identification of possible problems and supporting the Landmarks to take appropriate actions;
- gathering information on the performance, outputs and impacts of the Landmarks.

http://data.consilium.europa.eu/doc/document/ST-9507-2018-INIT/en/pdf

 $^{^1}$ Conclusions of the Council of the European Union of 29 May 2018 on Accelerating knowledge circulation in the EU. Doc 9507/18

² Ad hoc Working Group on Monitoring, June 2018 https://www.esfri.eu/working-groups/monitoring

³ Monitoring of Research Infrastructures Performance – ESFRI ad hoc Working Group Report, December 2019 https://www.esfri.eu/sites/default/files/ESFRI_WG_Monitoring_Report.pdf

⁴ All KPIs should be aligned with the objectives of RIs and fulfil RACER criteria: Relevant, Accepted, Credible, Easy to monitor, Robust. Each KPI should be accompanied by a reference sheet that provides a definition, data source(s), method of calculation, and other information concerning calculation or applicability – Recommendation 1, ibidem, pg. 4.

⁵ Proposal for the Implementation of the ESFRI Monitoring Approach, December 2021 <u>Microsoft Word - 13 FI21-77-10 ESFRI Landmark Monitoring Approach.docx</u>



Additionally, the outcomes of the Landmark monitoring exercise will provide insights into the functioning of the European RI ecosystem as a whole and will contribute to the identification of gaps in the European landscape and future opportunities for the RIs in Europe.

Each Landmark shall be monitored at regular intervals of about five years. Monitoring will be based on qualitative information gathered through a questionnaire and quantitative information represented by KPIs. In line with the two ESFRI monitoring reports mentioned in the previous chapter, RIs are invited to use the ESFRI KPIs, however, they may be replaced or complemented by other KPIs, which capture specific objectives of the Landmarks. The obtained information will be complemented by hearings (virtual) and site visits (if considered necessary by the Monitoring Panels), as relevant. The monitoring should be based as much as possible on the information already available, which Landmarks prepare for their governing bodies and the broader public.

Monitoring will cover Landmarks which have already started their operational phase and actively provide services. All eligible Landmarks will be monitored before the end of 2024, in three batches. Monitoring of the first batch will start in September 2022, after preparatory work starting from June 2022.

The Landmark monitoring process is coordinated by the ESFRI Monitoring Committee, while each Landmark will be analysed by a dedicated Monitoring Panel.

ROLE OF THE MONITORING COMMITTEE

The Monitoring Committee is responsible for the oversight of the monitoring process on behalf of ESFRI. It is composed of the Chairs of all SWGs, the Chair of the IG, selected EB Members and Delegates, as well as an EC representative. The Committee draws up the monitoring methodology, prepares general templates of the questionnaire and the monitoring report, proposes the timeline as well as coordinates its implementation.

MONITORING PANELS

The monitoring of individual Landmarks is carried out by dedicated Monitoring Panels. The Panels are established by the relevant SWGs and the IG.

The Panels are composed of 3-4 Members of the relevant SWGs (including at least one Member of SWG DIGIT to address the digital dimension of the RI), 1-2 Members of the IG. A representative of the European Commission may participate in the Panel as observer.

The Panels are advised by 2-3 external experts, at least one of which is identified by the involved SWGs and one by the IG. The external experts must have relevant experience and expertise in research infrastructures.

The Landmark will be informed about the names of the members of the Monitoring Panel and of the external experts.



The Panels should be established sufficiently in advance of the start of the monitoring of a particular Landmark. Each Panel should identify a Chair from among its members to organise and facilitate the work.

The Panels are responsible for engaging with the Landmarks throughout the monitoring process, discussing the KPIs used by the Landmark (checking what KPIs they use, to which extent they are consistent with ESFRI KPIs and the RACER criteria). If necessary, the Panels may ask additional questions to those in the questionnaires to be provided to each Landmark. The Panels are then responsible to analyse the gathered information, as well as to organise hearings (remotely) and site visits as relevant. The hearings may be combined with site visits, but all Panel members shall have the opportunity to attend the hearings. Hearings should generally allow the Landmarks to give a short presentation, focused on answering questions the panel asked in advance or to illustrate answers from the questionnaire.

The Panels draw up a monitoring report for each Landmark.

The collection of information through customised questionnaires and data feeding the KPIs is facilitated by the ESFRI MOS platform. The Landmark will electronically submit all the required data through the ESFRI MOS platform, using dedicated credentials provided.

PRINCIPLES, CONFLICT OF INTEREST (COI) AND CONFIDENTIALITY

Monitoring must comply with the following four principles:

- Independence, i.e. involved persons carry out the monitoring in a personal capacity and they
 represent neither their employer nor their country.
- Impartiality, i.e. persons must treat all Landmarks equally and assess them impartially on their merits, irrespective of their origin or the identity of the partners in the RI.
- Objectivity, i.e. involved persons carry out the monitoring based on the individual merit of each
 Landmark, refraining from any comparisons with other Landmarks.
- Accuracy, i.e. involved persons carry out the monitoring strictly in line with the agreed methodology and the relevant ESFRI documentation.

Each member of a Monitoring Panel must sign a declaration of the absence of conflict of interest (CoI) and a confidentiality declaration.

The Monitoring Committee checks any potential CoI of Panel members based on the self-declaration of the Panel members in advance of the exercise and confirms no CoI exists in the Panels. A CoI may arise, in particular, due to science competition, scientific and economic interests, political or national affinities, family or emotional ties, or any other relevant connection or shared interest.

Strict confidentiality rules apply. Any information obtained during the monitoring process beyond the agreed content of the Monitoring Reports must be kept confidential and may not be used for any other purpose. For each assessment, only the relevant persons will have access to a repository of all confidential documents.



The Monitoring reports from the Panels will be kept strictly internal to ESFRI (delegations, secretariat) to be used only for ESFRI purposes. However, the Landmarks themselves are free to make their report public and share to externals. The Monitoring committee will provide general reports to the Forum, indicating main findings in a generic way and not identifying single Landmarks. These reports may be published by ESFRI.

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE MONITORING PROCESS

The first cycle of Landmarks monitoring will be implemented from September 2022 until December 2024. It will cover all the ESFRI Landmarks listed in the 2018 Roadmap, which have entered the operational phase. It will thus not cover the new Landmarks from the 2021 Roadmap. Including non-operational Landmarks may be considered in duly justified cases.

The monitoring process will consist of the following steps:

- Agreement on the overall schedule of the whole monitoring cycle, including periods when each Landmark will be monitored, based on the proposal from the ESFRI Working Groups and in consultation with the concerned Landmarks
- Establishment of the monitoring panel for each Landmark, including external experts. The names will be communicated to Landmarks for information.
- Agreement with each Landmark on the list of additional documents the Landmark will submit (e.g. strategic plans and research agendas, annual reports, catalogues of services, etc.), the KPIs they will use as well as on the individual timeline
- Opening of the ESFRI MOS system
- Submission of the questionnaire, KPI data and other agreed documents by the Landmarks
- Initial analysis of the documents and agreement on follow-up questions
- Organisation of hearings and/or site visits
- Preparation of a draft report containing an analysis of all the elements requested to each Landmark
- Factual check of the draft report by the concerned Landmark
- Preparation of the final monitoring report for each Landmark, for approval of the Forum
- Preparation of the final report from the first Landmark monitoring cycle 2022-2024, for approval of the Forum

The individual reports will indicate whether the RIs should retain their Landmark quality mark. In case of significant issues found for a particular Research Infrastructure that could impact its Landmark status, a follow-up review focusing on the implementation of the recommendations will be scheduled within two years, after which the Forum will take a final decision, taking into account the recommendations of the second review.

After the first batch, the Monitoring Committee will consider if any adjustments to the monitoring process are necessary. At the end of the first monitoring cycle, ESFRI will carry out an in-depth evaluation of the monitoring system and procedures.

TIMELINE



Timeline for the monitoring of the $3^{\rm rd}$ batch of the Landmarks.

_			
STEPS	DATE / DEADLINE		
Establishment of Monitoring Panels	By 01 December 2023		
Kick-off meeting with Landmarks	07 December 2023		
Kick-off meeting with Panels	08 December 2023		
Identification of external experts for each Landmark	January 2024		
Agreement with Landmarks on the list of KPIs and of monitoring documents	January 2024		
Opening of the MOS+ system for Landmarks	February 2024		
Submission of documents by Landmarks	29 April 2024		
External experts workshop	May 2024		
External experts reports	27 July 2024		
Initial analysis of the documents and agreement on follow-up questions	01 September 2024		
Hearings / Site visits	01-27 September 2024		
Draft Reports by Monitoring Panels	11 October 2024		
Factual check by the Landmarks	18 October 2024		
Draft Final reports by Monitoring Panels	31 October 2024		
Review of the reports by the Monitoring Committee	15 November 2024		
Final reports by Monitoring Panels for approval of the Forum	30 November 2024		
Approval of the Forum	December 2024		

ATTRIBUTION OF LANDMARKS TO MONITORING BATCHES

Domain	Name	Full name	Roadmap (Y)	Landmark (Y)	Operation start (Y)	Monitoring Year
SCI	ESS ERIC	European Social Survey	2006	2016	2013	2022
SCI	CLARIN ERIC	Common Language Resources and Technology Infrastructure	2006	2016	2012	2022
SCI	SHARE ERIC	Survey of Health, Ageing and Retirement in Europe	2006	2016	2011	2023



DARIAH ERIC	Digital Research Infrastructure for the Arts and Humanities	2006	2016	2019	2023
CESSDA ERIC	Consortium of European Social Science Data Archives	2006	2016	2013	2024
ICOS ERIC	Integrated Carbon Observation System	2006	2016	2016	2022
EURO-ARGO ERIC	European contribution to the international Argo Programme	2006	2016	2014	2022
EPOS	European Plate Observing System	2008	2018	2023	2023
EMSO ERIC	European Multidisciplinary Seafloor and water-column Observatory	2006	2016	2016	2023
IAGOS	In-service Aircraft for a Global Observing System	2006	2016	2014	2023
LifeWatch ERIC	e-Infrastructure for Biodiversity and Ecosystem Research	2006	2016	2017	2024
EISCAT_3D	Next generation European Incoherent Scatter radar system	2008	2018	2023	2024
BBMRI ERIC	Biobanking and BioMolecular Resources Research Infrastructure	2006	2016	2014	2022
ECRIN ERIC	European Clinical Research Infrastructure Network	2006	2016	2014	2022
EATRIS ERIC	European Advanced Translational Research Infrastructure in Medicine	2006	2016	2013	2022
ELIXIR	A distributed infrastructure for life- science information	2006	2016	2014	2022
INFRAFRONTIER	European Research Infrastructure for the generation, phenotyping, archiving and distribution of mouse disease models	2006	2016	2013	2023
INSTRUCT ERIC	Integrated Structural Biology Infrastructure	2006	2016	2017	2023
Euro-Biolmaging	European Research Infrastructure for Imaging Technologies in Biological and Biomedical Sciences	2008	2018	2016	2023
EMBRC ERIC	European Marine Biological Resource Centre	2008	2018	2017	2023
EU- OPENSCREEN ERIC	European Infrastructure of Open Screening Platforms for Chemical Biology	2008	2018	2021	2024
ERINHA	European Research Infrastructure on Highly Pathogenic Agents	2008	2018	2018	2024
ECCSEL ERIC	European Carbon Dioxide Capture and Storage Laboratory Infrastructure	2008	2018	2016	2022
PRACE	Partnership for Advanced Computing in Europe	2006	2016	2010	2024
ESRF EBS	European Synchrotron Radiation Facility Extremely Brilliant Source	2006	2016	2020	2022
	CESSDA ERIC ICOS ERIC EURO-ARGO ERIC EPOS EMSO ERIC IAGOS LifeWatch ERIC EISCAT_3D BBMRI ERIC ECRIN ERIC EATRIS ERIC ELIXIR INFRAFRONTIER INSTRUCT ERIC EUro-Biolmaging EMBRC ERIC EU- OPENSCREEN ERIC ERINHA ECCSEL ERIC PRACE	CESSDA ERIC CONSORTIUM of European Social Science Data Archives ICOS ERIC Integrated Carbon Observation System EURO-ARGO ERIC EUROPean Contribution to the international Argo Programme EPOS European Plate Observing System EMSO ERIC In-service Aircraft for a Global Observing System LifeWatch ERIC EISCAT_3D Next generation European Incoherent Scatter radar system BBMRI ERIC ECRIN ERIC EUROPean Advanced Translational Research Infrastructure Network EATRIS ERIC ELIXIR A distributed infrastructure for lifescience information EUROPean Research Infrastructure for the generation, phenotyping, archiving and distribution of mouse disease models INSTRUCT ERIC EUROPEAN Research Infrastructure for Imaging Technologies in Biological and Biomedical Sciences EMBRC ERIC EUROPEAN Marine Biological Resource Centre EUROPENSCREEN European Infrastructure of Open Screening Platforms for Chemical Biology ECSEL ERIC EUROPEAN Research Infrastructure on Highly Pathogenic Agents EUROPEAN Carbon Dioxide Capture and Storage Laboratory Infrastructure PRACE EUROPEAN Synchrotron Radiation Facility European Synchrotron Radiation Facility	CESSDA ERIC CESSDA ERIC CONSORTIUM of European Social Science Data Archives LICOS ERIC Integrated Carbon Observation System EURO-ARGO EURO-ARGO EUropean Plate Observing System EUROS EUROPEAN Multidisciplinary Seafloor and water-column Observatory IAGOS In-service Aircraft for a Global Observing System LifeWatch ERIC EISCAT_3D BEMRI ERIC EUROPEAN Clinical Research BIODANKING and BIOMOlecular Resources Research Infrastructure Network ELIXIR A distributed infrastructure for life-science information ELIXIR A distributed infrastructure for life-science information EUROPEAN Clinical Research Infrastructure for life-science information ELIXIR A distributed infrastructure for life-science information EUROPEAN Research Infrastructure for the generation, phenotyping, archiving and distribution of mouse disease models INSTRUCT ERIC EUROPEAN Research Infrastructure for linegrated Structural Biology Infrastructure EUROPENSCREEN EUROPEAN Research Infrastructure for linegring Technologies in Biological and Biomedical Sciences EMBRC ERIC EUROPEAN Research Infrastructure for Centre EUROPENSCREEN EUROPEAN Research Infrastructure of Open Screening Platforms for Chemical Biology ERINHA European Research Infrastructure on Highly Pathogenic Agents EUROPEAN Research Infrastructure on Highly Pathogenic Agents EUROPEAN Research Infrastructure on Highly Pathogenic Agents EUROPE Partnership for Advanced Computing in European Sunchortoron Radiation Facility EUROPEAN Synchrotron Radiation Facility	CESSDA ERIC Consortium of European Social Science Data Archives ICOS ERIC Integrated Carbon Observation System 2006 2016 EURO-ARGO European contribution to the international Argo Programme 2006 2016 EPOS European Plate Observing System 2008 2018 EMSO ERIC European Multidisciplinary Seafloor and water-column Observatory 2006 2016 In-service Aircraft for a Global Observing System 2008 2016 LifeWatch ERIC e-Infrastructure for Biodiversity and Ecosystem Research 2008 2016 EISCAT_3D Next generation European Incoherent 2008 2016 EISCAT_3D Sibanking and BioMolecular Resources Research Infrastructure Present Infrastructure Present Infrastructure Present Infrastructure Present Infrastructure Present Infrastructure Inf	CESSDA ERIC Consortium of European Social Science Data Archives ICOS ERIC Integrated Carbon Observation System 2006 2016 2016 EURO-ARGO European contribution to the international Argo Programme 2006 2016 2014 EPOS European Plate Observing System 2008 2018 2023 EMSO ERIC European Multidisciplinary Seafloor and water-column Observatory 2006 2016 2016 2016 IAGOS In-service Aircraft for a Global Observing System 2008 2018 2023 EMSO ERIC European Multidisciplinary Seafloor and water-column Observatory 2006 2016 2016 2014 LifeWatch ERIC el-Infrastructure for Biodiversity and Ecosystem Research 2008 2018 2023 EISCAT_3D Next generation European Incoherent Scatter radar system 2008 2018 2023 BBMRI ERIC Biobanking and BioMolecular Resources Research Infrastructure 2006 2016 2014 ECRIN ERIC European Chinical Research Infrastructure 2006 2016 2014 EATRIS ERIC European Advanced Translational Research Infrastructure in Medicine 2006 2016 2014 ELIXIR Adistributed infrastructure for lifescience information 2006 2016 2014 INSTRUCT ERIC Infrastructure Infrastructure for the generation, phenotyping, archiving and distribution of mouse disease models 1 Instructure 1 Integrated Structural Biology 1 Infrastructure 1 Integrated Structural Biology 1 Infrastructure 1 Integrated Structural Biology 1 2006 2016 2017 EURO-Biolimaging European Research Infrastructure for Euro-Biolimaging Technologies in Biological and Biomedical Sciences 2 European Marine Biological Resource 2008 2018 2016 EMBRC ERIC European Marine Biological Resource 2008 2018 2016 2016 2017 EURO-BIOLOGICA European Research Infrastructure of Open Screening Platforms for Chemical Biology 2006 2016 2018 2018 ECCSEL ERIC European Research Infrastructure and Storage Laboratory Infrastructure 2008 2018 2018 2018 ECCSEL ERIC European System Company 2006 2016 2010 2010



PSE	SPIRAL2	Système de Production d'Ions Radioactifs en Ligne de 2e génération	2006	2016	2019	2022
PSE	ILL	Institut Max von Laue-Paul Langevin	2006	2016	NA	2023
PSE	EMFL	European Magnetic Field Laboratory	2008	2016	2014	2023
PSE	European XFEL	European X-Ray Free-Electron Laser Facility	2006	2016	2017	2024
PSE	ELI ERIC	Extreme Light Infrastructure	2006	2016	2018	2024

TOTAL	2022	2023	2024
30	11	11	8